

# Golden Parachutes and the Wealth of Shareholders

Lucian Bebchuk (Harvard) Alma Cohen (Tel-Aviv, Harvard) Charles C.Y. Wang (Stanford, Harvard)

Yale SOM, November 2010



## **Motivation**

- GPs have attracted much debate and attention since the late '70s and early '80s
  - Congress in '84 imposed substantial tax penalties on large GPs to discourage their use
  - Rise in shareholder precatory resolutions opposing GPs
  - President Obama and Treasury Secretary Geithner aim to *"take the air out of golden parachutes"*
  - 2010 Dodd-Frank Act mandates shareholder advisory votes on all adoptions of GP by public firms.
- We seek to inform this debate by investigating how GPs are associated with:
  - Acquisition outcomes: likelihood, premiums, and expected premiums.
  - The evolution of firm value over time.



### **Main Findings**

• GPs and Acquisition Outcomes:



- GP negatively associated with acquisition premia
- GPs <u>positively</u> associated with expected premia from an acquisition.
- GPs and Evolution of Firm Value:
  - Firms adopting GPs tend to have lower Tobin's Q value already in the IRRC volume preceding the adoption
  - The value of firms adopting GPs but their value <u>continues to erode</u> during the inter-volume period of adoption and <u>continues to erode subsequently</u>.

## **Literature Review**

There is substantial empirical literature on GPs

- Event studies around GP adoptions, with mixed results (Lambert & Larcker '85; Born, Faria, & Trahan '93; Mogavero & Toyne '95; Hall & Anderson '97)
   Unlike these studies, we examine the evolution of value in a much longer window.
- Evidence of negative correlation between GP and Q, but does not indicate timing when the negative correlation arises (Gompers, Metrick, Ishii '03; Bebchuk, Cohen, and Farrell '09)
- Literature on the direct effects of GPs on acquisition likelihood and premia (but not on the expected premia) but with mixed results.
  (Machlin, Choe, and Miles '93; Born, Faria, &Trahan '93; Cotter and Zenner '94; Hall and Anderson '97; Lefanowicz, Robinson, and Smith '00; Fich, Tran, and Walking '09)



## **Data Description**

- Data on Golden Parachutes
  - Investor Responsibility Research Center (IRRC)
    - 8 Volumes: 1990, 1993, 1995, 1998, 2000, 2002, 2004, 2006
    - Tracks corporate governance provisions for 1400~1800 largest firms
- Benefits of IRRC
  - Broad coverage (> 90% of total U.S. market cap)
  - Long time series
  - Data on other governance measures (poison pill, staggered board, etc...)
- Weaknesses of IRRC
  - No exact GP contract details and size of parachute
  - Only has snap-shots every 2~3 years, don't have exact adoption dates



## **Summary Statistics I**

Stock of GPs in each IRRC volume rising over time

IRRC	# Firms in		% of Firms
Volume	IRRC Volume	Firms w/ GP	w/ GP
1990	1,467	740	50.4%
1993	1,463	780	53.3%
1995	1,496	802	53.6%
1998	1,913	1060	55.4%
2000	1,886	1223	64.9%
2002	1,894	1282	67.7%
2004	1,982	1455	73.4%
2006	1,897	1473	77.7%

## **Summary Statistics II**

Adoption of GPs in each IRRC volume averages to 22.4% of eligible adopters



Years	Total Firms	Firms with no GP beginning of period	Num of Adopters	% of Adopters
1990~1993	1,272	639	101	15.8%
1993~1995	1,344	641	79	12.3%
1995~1998	1,214	594	142	23.9%
1998~2000	1,667	768	214	27.9%
2000~2002	1,416	533	160	30.0%
2002~2004	1,654	529	131	24.8%
2004~2006	1,656	455	100	22.0%

### **Summary Statistics III** Incidence of acquisition positively associated with GPs

		ving Initial t Calendar			quired in t Calendar Ye	
	No GP	GP	Diff	No GP	GP	Diff
1990	4.64%	4.70%	+	2.48%	2.35%	-
1991	2.71%	3.63%	+	1.86%	2.57%	+
1992	2.96%	3.42%	+	2.79%	3.11%	+
1993	3.24%	4.58%	+	1.87%	2.08%	+
1994	5.76%	8.05%	+	1.92%	5.46%	+
1995	3.97%	7.45%	+	2.64%	4.41%	+
1996	4.78%	9.87%	+	3.92%	8.56%	+
1997	8.41%	9.08%	+	5.01%	7.32%	+
1998	7.85%	12.74%	+	6.25%	10.24%	+
1999	6.17%	9.68%	+	6.47%	9.43%	+
2000	3.66%	5.14%	+	3.66%	5.57%	+
2001	1.94%	2.64%	+	1.08%	2.75%	+
2002	3.54%	3.90%	+	2.29%	2.57%	+
2003	3.21%	4.75%	+	3.00%	4.02%	+
2004	4.27%	6.06%	+	1.76%	4.58%	+
2005	6.98%	8.08%	+	5.43%	4.81%	-
2006	5.28%	9.80%	+	5.59%	8.16%	+
Mean	4.7 %	6.7 %	2.0 % **	* 3.4 %	5.2 %	1.8 % ***



Bid (acquisition) incidence is **43% (52%)** greater for GP firms over Non-GP firms

## **GP and Likelihood of Acquisitions**

### GP associated with higher bid/acquisition likelihood

Probit Dependent Var	Receive Bid Next Year		Acquired N	ext Year
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Golden Parachute	0.0148 ***	0.0154 ***	0.0128 ***	0.0136 ***
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.002)	(0.002)
EIndex-GP	-0.0046 ***	-0.0048 ***	-0.0015	-0.0017
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
GIndex - EIndex	0.0003	0.0004	0.0004	0.0004
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
Log Rel Q	-0.0196 ***	-0.0174 ***	-0.0074 ***	(0.006) **
	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.003)	(0.003)
Ind Rel Market Cap	(0.001) ***	-0.0012 ***	-0.0009 ***	-0.0011 ***
	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
Ind Rel Debt/Asset	0.0143	0.0122	-0.0014	-0.0038
	(0.009)	(0.009)	(0.007)	(0.007)
Delaware Inc	0.0133 ***	0.0109 ***	0.0076 ***	0.0066 ***
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.002)	(0.002)
Log(CEO Age)	-0.0060	-0.0015	-0.0050	-0.0002
	(0.015)	(0.014)	(0.012)	(0.012)
Log(CEO Tenure)	-0.0044 ***	-0.0044 ***	-0.0020	-0.0021 *
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)
Herfindahl Index	-0.0190 *		-0.0152 *	
	(0.011)		(0.009)	
Dependent Var Mean	0.0567	0.0569	0.0398	0 0401
Proportional Marginal Effect	0.2609	0.2706	0.3220	0.3388
Year Controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Industry Controls	No	Yes	No	Yes
Cluster SE	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Pseudo R-squared	0.0500	0.0640	0.0700	0.0840
Observations	19,747	19,683	19,747	19,554



Note1: Marginal FX reported

### **Generality of the Association between GP & Acquisitions II**

A) Delaware Incorporated vs.	. None Delaware Inco	rporated				
	GPxDEInc	GPxNotDEInc	Diff			
(1) Using HHI as Ind Control	0.0117 ***	0.0098 ***	0.0019			
	(0.003)	(0.005)	(0.005)			
(2) Using FE as Ind Control	0.0133 ***	0.0130 ***	0.0003			
	(0.003)	(0.006)	(0.005)			
B) Positive Industry Relative Q vs. Negative Industry Relative Q						
	GPx +IndRelQ	GPx -IndRelQ	Diff			
(1) Using HHI as Ind Control	0.0138 ***	0.0167 ***	-0.0029			
	(0.003)	(0.005)	(0.005)			
(2) Using FE as Ind Control	0.0142 ***	0.0160 ***	-0.0018			
	(0.003)	(0.005)	(0.005)			
C) Positive Industry Relative	Mcap vs. Negative In	dustry Relative Mc	ıp			
	GPx +IndRelSize	GPx -IndRelSize	Diff			
(1) Using HHI as Ind Control	0.0125 ***	0.0128 ***	-0.0003			
	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.005)			
(2) Using FE as Ind Control	0.0135 ***	0.0139 ***	-0.0004			
	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.005)			
D) Top Quartile HHI vs. Low	Quartile HHI					
	GPxHiHHI	GPxLowHHI	Diff			
(1) Using HHI as Ind Control	0.0125 ***	0.0125 ***	0.0000			
	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.005)			
(2) Using FE as Ind Control	0.0127 ***	0.0103 ***	0.0024			
	(0.003)	(0.004)	(0.005)			



Note 1: Marginal FX reported Note 2: Only interaction terms reported. Main effects and controls suppressed

# Interpreting the Association between GP and Acquisitions I



- Positive association between GP and acquisition likelihood result from ...
  - Incentive (Causality) Effect
  - Private Information Effect (Lambert-Larcker, 85)
- We test whether the effect is entirely driven by private information using the timing of GP adoption
  - If managers adopt GP in anticipation of acquisition bid → relationship with acquisition should be driven by newly-adopted GP's

interpreting th	C A3300				
Probit Dependent Var	Acquired by N	ext IRRC Vol	Acquired by I	Next IRRC Vol	
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	
Golden Parachute	0.0337 ***	0.0353 ***			
	(0.005)	(0.005)			
Old GP			0.0345 ***	0.0377 ***	Diff = -0.003
			(0.006)	(0.006)	
Fresh GP			0.0392 ***	0.0406 ***	<b>PVal= 0.324</b>
			(0.013)	(0.013)	
Eindex-GP	-0.0012	-0.0016	-0.0002	-0.0006	
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	
Gindex - Eindex	0.0021	0.0021	0.0016	0.0016	
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Log Rel Q	-0.0057	-0.0040	-0.0039	-0.0021	
	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)	
Ind Rel Market Cap	-0.0011 ***	-0.0013 ***	-0.0012 ***	-0.0014 ***	
	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	
Ind Rel Debt/Asset	-0.0039	-0.0053	-0.0007	-0.0028	
	(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.014)	
Delaware Inc	0.0155 ***	0.0133 ***	0.0173 ***	0.0150 ***	
	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)	
CEO Age	-0.0235	-0.0121	-0.0249	-0.0132	
	(0.028)	(0.027)	(0.028)	(0.028)	
CEO Tenure	-0.0054 *	-0.0060 **	-0.0055 *	-0.0062 **	
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	
Herfindahl Index	-0.0163		-0.0171		
	(0.018)		(0.018)		
Dependent Var Mean	0.0950	0.0956	0.0950	0.0956	
Proportional Marginal Effect	0.3548	0.3694	.4127/.3632	.4249/.3946	
Year Controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Note 1: Marginal F
Industry Controls	No	Yes	No	Yes	Note 2: Estimation
Cluster SE	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	control for
Pseudo R-squared	0.1750	0.1870	0.1730	0.1860	
Observations	10,422	10,361	10,422	10,361	similar res
	, · <b></b>	,	,	,- • •	

### Interpreting the Association between GP and Acquisitions II



ginal FX reported mation using HHI to trol for industry yields ilar results

# **GP and Acquisition Premium**

Dependent Var	1Wk Prem	ln(1Wk Prem)	4Wk Prem	ln(4Wk Prem)
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Golden Parachute	-0.0357 **	-0.1280 <sup>a</sup>	-0.0433 **	-0.1921 **
	(0.017)	(0.077)	(0.020)	(0.093)
EIndex-GP	0.0166 **	0.0428	0.0124	0.0311
	(0.007)	(0.026)	(0.009)	(0.029)
GIndex-EIndex	0.0062	0.0194	0.0002	(0.002)
	(0.004)	(0.019)	(0.005)	(0.015)
Delaware Inc	0.0092	-0.0418	0.0140	-0.0193
	(0.015)	(0.059)	(0.017)	(0.070)
Log Rel Q	-0.0303	-0.0242	-0.0368	-0.0142
	(0.028)	(0.075)	(0.035)	(0.077)
Inside Ownership	-0.0014	0.0006	-0.0025	-0.0053
	(0.002)	(0.006)	(0.002)	(0.008)
Log(Assets)	-0.0179 *	-0.0377	-0.0221 **	-0.0625 *
	(0.009)	(0.034)	(0.010)	(0.032)
Debt/Asset	0.0590	0.1813	0.0462	0.2567
	(0.049)	(0.206)	(0.047)	(0.173)
Hostile Bid	0.0930 *	0.2503 *	0.0545	0.2869 ***
	(0.053)	(0.139)	(0.040)	(0.105)
Tender Offer	0.0591 *	0.2175 **	0.1031 ***	0.2771 **
	(0.034)	(0.089)	(0.037)	(0.114)
Toehold	-0.0011	-0.0036	-0.0021	-0.0026
	(0.002)	(0.006)	(0.001)	(0.005)
Termination Fee	-0.0068	-0.0027	0.0005	0.1233
	(0.023)	(0.071)	(0.021)	(0.091)
Stock Swap	-0.0125	-0.1606 *	-0.0183	-0.1640 *
	(0.026)	(0.083)	(0.026)	(0.085)
Log(Time)	0.0180	0.0528	0.0152	0.0443
	(0.021)	(0.065)	(0.023)	(0.067)
Log(CEO Age)	-0.0910	-0.4395	-0.1810	-0.8681 **
	(0.134)	(0.489)	(0.127)	(0.413)
Log(CEO Tenure)	0.0180	0.1000 **	0.0130	0.0636
	(0.019)	(0.046)	(0.021)	(0.049)
Adjusted R-squared	0.1140	0.0780	0.1530	0.0720
Observations	756	756	753	753



# Interpreting Association between GP and Acquisition Premium I

- Explanations?
  - GP decreases manager's threshold, making manager more receptive to acquisitions
    - \* Weakens bargaining position in acquisitions that will take place regardless of a GP
    - \* Introduces additional (lower-value) acquisitions.



# Interpreting Association between GP and Acquisition Premium II

- Alternative Explanations?
  - GP as a compensation-shifting tool (Choi '04)
    - Shareholder shifts compensation burden to buyer in the event of acquisition
    - Lowers shareholder return in acquisition, but benefits shareholder ex-ante by lowering manager's non-acquisition compensation
    - But, model also predicts GPs decrease acquisition likelihood
  - Disloyal managers trading off premiums and private benefits (Hartzell, Ofek, and Yermack '04)
    - Certain CEOs negotiate increased golden parachutes along with special cash bonuses during acquisition deals in exchange for lower premium
    - The GPs we study in our data set are adopted ex ante



# GP and Expected Acquisition Premiums

Dependent Var	1Wk Prem	ln(1Wk Prem)	4Wk Prem	ln(4Wk Prem)
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Golden Parachute	0.0036 ***	0.0344 ***	0.0036 ***	0.0367 ***
	(0.001)	(0.008)	(0.001)	(0.008)
EIndex-GP	-0.0002	-0.0034	0.0000	-0.0032
	(0.000)	(0.003)	(0.000)	(0.003)
GIndex-EIndex	-0.0003	-0.0015	0.0000	-0.0008
	(0.000)	(0.002)	(0.000)	(0.002)
Delaware Inc	0.0022 *	0.0157	0.0019 *	0.0148
	(0.001)	(0.010)	(0.001)	(0.010)
Log Rel Q	-0.0033 **	-0.0173	-0.0031 **	-0.0192 *
	(0.001)	(0.012)	(0.001)	(0.011)
Log Size	0.0000	-0.0004 *	0.0000	-0.0004 *
	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
Inside Ownership	-0.0002 ***	-0.0013 **	-0.0002 **	-0.0013 **
	(0.000)	(0.001)	(0.000)	(0.001)
Log(Assets)	-0.0027 ***	-0.0196 ***	-0.0023 ***	-0.0184 ***
	(0.000)	(0.003)	(0.000)	(0.003)
Debt/Asset	0.0009	-0.0038	-0.0013	-0.0229
	(0.005)	(0.033)	(0.003)	(0.025)
Log(CEO Age)	-0.0007	0.0142	-0.0010	0.0193
	(0.005)	(0.032)	(0.003)	(0.028)
Log(CEO Tenure)	0.0002	0.0005	0.0003	-0.0001
	(0.000)	(0.004)	(0.000)	(0.004)
Adjusted R-squared	0.0160	0.0180	0.0140	0.0170
Observations	22918	22915	22918	22918



## **GP and Firm Value**

- Earlier literature has documented the negative association between Q and GP (GIM '03; BCF '09)
  - However, the timing in the deterioration of firm value is unclear.
- We investigate whether the negative association arises...
  - Prior to adoption of GP?
  - In period between IRRC volumes around the adoption of GP?
  - After adoption of GP?
- To answer these, use inter-volume changes in GP

## Adopters have low Q prior to adoption of GP

Dependent Var	Log(Industry Relative Q)			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	
Future GP Adopter	-0.0494 **	-0.0554 **	-0.0475 *	
	(0.024)	(0.024)	(0.025)	
Other Provisions in E	-0.0352 ***	-0.0308 **	-0.0350 ***	
	(0.009)	(0.013)	(0.013)	
Other Provisions in G	0.0172 ***	0.0132 *	0.0171 **	
	(0.005)	(0.008)	(0.008)	
ROA	0.4928 ***	0.4724 ***	0.4905 ***	
	(0.186)	(0.179)	(0.187)	
Log(Assets)	0.0058	0.0077	0.0055	
	(0.007)	(0.013)	(0.011)	
CAPEX / Assets	0.5411 ***	0.9536 ***	0.5525 ***	
	(0.154)	(0.243)	(0.198)	
Log(Age)	-0.1254 ***	-0.1139 ***	-0.1251 ***	
	(0.014)	(0.020)	(0.019)	
Rel Debt / Assets	-0.4504 ***	-0.4266 ***	-0.4504 ***	
	(0.081)	(0.129)	(0.123)	
R&D / Sales	0.0226	0.0261	0.0229	
	(0.017)	(0.017)	(0.017)	
Herfindahl Index			0.0761	
			(0.103)	
Industry FE	No	Yes	No	
Year FE	No	Yes	Yes	
SE	Robust	Cluster	Cluster	
Adjusted R-squared	0.2197	0.2682	0.2198	
Observations	2,540	2,540	2,540	

Relative to non-adopters, future GP adopters' Q <u>4~5% lower</u>

Note:

Future GP Adopter is an indicator where...

1: a firm that adopts GP by the next IRRC volume

0 indicates firm that does not have GP in current and next volume

### Q continues to decrease around adoption I

Dependent Var	<b>ΔLog(Industry Relative Q)</b>			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	
Future GP Adopter	-0.0582 ***	-0.0475 **	-0.0581 ***	
	(0.020)	(0.021)	(0.020)	
$\Delta$ Other Provisions in E	-0.0218	-0.0200	-0.0216	
	(0.022)	(0.022)	(0.022)	
$\Delta$ Other Provisions in G	-0.0031	-0.0050	-0.0032	
	(0.011)	(0.011)	(0.011)	
$\Delta$ ROA	0.2038 **	0.2122 **	0.2038 **	
	(0.096)	(0.102)	(0.096)	
$\Delta$ Log Assets	-0.1055 ***	-0.1061 ***	-0.1053 ***	
	(0.030)	(0.031)	(0.030)	
$\Delta$ CAPEX / Assets	0.3373 *	0.3497	0.3386	
	(0.198)	(0.222)	(0.216)	
$\Delta$ Log Rel Debt / Assets	-0.3212 ***	-0.2803 ***	-0.3201 ***	
	(0.060)	(0.061)	(0.059)	
Δ Log Age	-0.4800 ***	-0.4867 ***	-0.4803 ***	
	(0.090)	(0.094)	(0.093)	
$\Delta$ R&D / Sales	-0.0001	-0.0003	-0.0001	
	(0.009)	(0.008)	(0.008)	
$\Delta$ Herfindahl Index			0.0612	
			(0.115)	
Industry FE	No	Yes	No	
Year FE	No	Yes	Yes	
SE	Robust	Cluster	Cluster	
Adjusted R-squared	0.1386	0.1346	0.1383	
Observations	2,429	2,429	2,429	

Relative to non-adopters, future GP adopters experience volume-tovolume (over next 2~3 yrs) change in Q <u>4~5% lower</u>

#### Note:

Future GP Adopter is an indicator where...

1: firm adopts GP by the next IRRC volume

0: firm does not have GP in current and next volume

### Q continues to decrease around adoption II

Dependent Var	ΔLog(	Industry Relat	ive Q)	-
	(1)	(2)	(3)	-
ΔGP	-0.0460 ***	-0.0435 **	-0.0460 ***	
	(0.016)	(0.017)	(0.017)	
$\Delta$ Other Provisions in E	-0.0218 *	-0.0190	-0.0216 *	
	(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.012)	
$\Delta$ Other Provisions in G	0.0001	-0.0003	0.0002	
	(0.007)	(0.008)	(0.008)	
$\Delta$ ROA	0.3285 **	0.3322 **	0.3285 **	
	(0.149)	(0.149)	(0.149)	
$\Delta$ Log Assets	-0.1816 ***	-0.1811 ***	-0.1813 ***	
	(0.020)	(0.022)	(0.022)	
$\Delta$ CAPEX / Assets	0.4300 ***	0.4313 ***	0.4318 ***	
	(0.138)	(0.151)	(0.150)	
$\Delta$ Log Rel Debt / Assets	-0.2681 ***	-0.2656 ***	-0.2685 ***	
	(0.061)	(0.067)	(0.067)	
Δ Log Age	-0.2155 ***	-0.184 ***	-0.2147 ***	
	(0.038)	(0.036)	(0.036)	
Δ R&D / Sales	-0.0004	-0.0004	-0.0004	
	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.006)	
$\Delta$ Herfindahl Index			0.0799	
			(0.062)	
Industry FE	No	Yes	No	
Year FE	No	Yes	Yes	
SE	Robust	Cluster	Cluster	
Adjusted R-squared	0.1280	0.1288	0.1280	
Observations	6,287	6,287	6,287	

The long-term event window (2~3 years) surrounding GP adoption associated with a <u>4.5% decrease in Q</u>

#### Note:

This is a changes regression run on the full set of firms that show up in two consecutive volumes

### Q continues to drop for long-term adopters

Dependent Var	<b>ΔLog(Industry Relative Q)</b>			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	
LT GP Adopter	-0.0484 <sup>a</sup>	-0.0619 *	-0.0531 *	
	(0.031)	(0.032)	(0.030)	
$\Delta$ Other Provisions in E	0.0121	0.0124	0.0106	
	(0.024)	(0.026)	(0.025)	
$\Delta$ Other Provisions in G	-0.0019	-0.0031	-0.0015	
	(0.011)	(0.012)	(0.012)	
$\Delta$ ROA	1.0137 ***	1.0136 ***	1.0123 ***	
	(0.147)	(0.158)	(0.155)	
$\Delta$ Log Assets	-0.1033 **	-0.116 **	-0.1049 **	
	(0.044)	(0.045)	(0.043)	
$\Delta$ CAPEX / Assets	-0.0775	-0.0342	-0.0774	
	(0.206)	(0.240)	(0.231)	
$\Delta$ Log Rel Debt / Assets	-0.4042 ***	-0.3849 ***	-0.4039 ***	
	(0.120)	(0.123)	(0.121)	
Δ Log Age	-0.2035	-0.2503 *	-0.2075 *	
	(0.129)	(0.129)	(0.121)	
Δ R&D / Sales	-0.0494 ***	-0.0495 ***	-0.0495 ***	
	(0.011)	(0.011)	(0.011)	
$\Delta$ Herfindahl Index			-0.3045 **	
			(0.137)	
Industry FE	No	Yes	No	
Year FE	No	Yes	Yes	
SE	Robust	Cluster	Cluster	
Adjusted R-squared	0.1631	0.1567	0.1645	
Observations	1,410	1,410	1,410	

Relative to LT non-adopters, LT GP adopters experience volume-tovolume (2~3 years) change in Q about <u>4~6% lower</u>

- Note: LT GP Adopter is an indicator where...
- 1: firm has GP in the preceding, current, and next IRRC volumes

0: firm does not have GP in the preceding, current, and next volumes

## Stock returns decrease prior to adoption

Dependent Var	<b>Monthly Portfolio Returns</b>		
	(1)	(2)	
	VW	EW	
Alpha	-0.0059 ***	-0.0035 ***	]•
	(0.002)	(0.001)	
Rm-Rf	0.0034	0.0153	
	(0.056)	(0.030)	
SMB	0.0834	0.1219 ***	
	(0.067)	(0.037)	No
HML	0.2827 ***	0.1256 ***	•
	(0.096)	(0.042)	
Carhart	-0.0175	-0.0169	•
	(0.043)	(0.027)	
N	160	160	•
Adj. Rsq	0.0861	0.0852	•



On annualized basis... VW: -6.85% EW: -4.12%

Note on portfolio formation:

- Long future adopters i.e., firms with no GP in current and next IRRC volume, adopts by 2 IRRC volume from now
- Short long-term non-adopters
  i.e., firms with no GP in current and subsequent 2 IRRC volumes
- Rebalance monthly
- Update portfolio whenever new governance information from IRRC becomes available

Dependent Var	Monthly Portfolio Returns			
	(1)	(2)		
	VW	EW		
Alpha	-0.0037 **	-0.0020 *		
	(0.002)	(0.001)		
Rm-Rf	-0.0320	-0.0195		
	(0.040)	(0.027)		
SMB	0.2017 ***	0.1310 ***		
	(0.050)	(0.037)		
HML	0.2120 ***	0.0942 *		
	(0.066)	(0.051)		
Carhart	-0.0585 **	-0.1262 ***		
	(0.025)	(0.024)		
N	184	184		
Adj. Rsq	0.1185	0.2695		



On annualized basis...
 VW: -4.35% EW: -2.37

#### Note on portfolio formation

- Long firms with no GP in current IRRC volume and adopts by the next IRRC volume
- Short firms with no GP in current and subsequent IRRC volumes
- Rebalance monthly
- Update portfolio whenever new governance information from IRRC becomes available

## Stock returns decrease after adoption

Dependent Var	Monthly Portfolio Returns				
	Firms in 3 Conse	cutive Volumes	Including Ac	quired Firms	
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	
	VW	EW	VW	EW	
Alpha	-0.0037 **	-0.0028 ***	-0.0032 **	-0.0024 **	
	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	(0.001)	
Rm-Rf	0.0183	0.0127	0.0155	0.013	
	(0.039)	(0.021)	(0.040)	(0.023)	
SMB	0.1203 ***	0.0242	0.1189 ***	0.0141	
	(0.040)	(0.028)	(0.041)	(0.030)	
HML	0.5274 ***	0.2904 ***	0.5306 ***	0.2866 ***	
	(0.062)	(0.031)	(0.062)	(0.033)	
Carhart	0.0285	0.0063	0.0269	0.0133	
	(0.028)	(0.013)	(0.028)	(0.013)	
Ν	150	150	150	150	
Adj. Rsq	0.5094	0.4876	0.5156	0.4755	

Note on portfolio formation

- Long firms with GP in current and subsequent IRRC volumes
- Short firms with no GP in current and subsequent IRRC volumes
- Rebalance monthly
- Update portfolio whenever new governance information from IRRC becomes available

On annualized basis... VW: -4.35% EW: -3.31% On annualized basis... VW: -3.77% EW: -2.84%

### **Interpreting Results on GP and Firm Value**

- Firms have low Q and declining returns prior to adoption of GP
  - Consistent with selection
- Firms have declining Q and stock returns in the long-term event window (2~3 years between IRRC volumes) around GP adoption
  - Consistent with selection
  - Consistent with managerial slack (Shleifer and Vishny '98; GIM '03; BCF '09)
- Firms continue to experience decrease in stock returns (and Q) post-adoption, relative to non-adopters
  - Consistent with managerial slack (Shleifer and Vishny '98; GIM '03; BCF '09))
  - Not consistent with GP inducing LT focus (Stein '98)

# Conclusion

- We contribute to the empirical evidence on the long-term implications of GPs using IRRC data
  - GPs are positively associated with acquisition likelihood, negatively associated with premiums in the event of an acquisition, and positively associated with (unconditional) premia from an acquisition.
  - Firms adopting GPs have lower value to begin with but their value continues to erode during the inter-volume period of adoption and subsequently.